

## Appendix 1

Appendix 1 presents the detailed analysis run results from the MCA process. These results matrix sheets include the detailed weighted scores that each option obtained against each of the performance criteria, as well as the final total score and option ranking.

Figure A.1 to Figure A.5 present the results from MCA runs A1 to A5 (covering the 2005-2010 time period). Figure A.6 to A.10 provide the results from MCA runs B1 to B5 (covering the 2011-2025 time period), whilst the results from runs C1 to C5 (2025-2050 time period) can be found in Figure A.11 to Figure A.15.

Options	Costs			Emissions						Traffic impacts			Social impacts			Feasibility		Total score	Rank									
	Annualised capital cost	Annual operating cost		NOx emissions	PM <sub>10</sub> emissions	CO emissions	HC emissions	Ground level ozone	CO <sub>2</sub> emissions	Noise	Congestion	Accident rate	Social cohesion	Quality of life	Distribution effects	Public acceptability	Practicality											
Performance criteria weighting factors	60	40	100	10	35	1	9	15	30	100	10	45	45	100	10	60	40	100	40	60	100	500						
Theme weighting factors			30										20					10				100						
SCR with diesel particulate filter (10% uptake on heavy-duty vehicles) (LOW COST ESTIMATE)	54	24	77.7	23.3	7	23	1	3	15	8	58.7	17.0	0	11	0	11	2	5	25	16	48	4.8	16	30	46	4.8	51.8	3
SCR with diesel particulate filter (10% uptake on heavy-duty vehicles) (HIGH COST ESTIMATE)	44	24	68.3	20.5	7	23	1	3	15	8	58.7	17.0	0	11	0	11	2	5	25	16	48	4.8	16	30	46	4.8	49.0	8
EGR with diesel particulate filter (10% uptake on heavy-duty vehicles) (LOW COST ESTIMATE)	55	24	78.8	23.8	5	23	1	6	10	7	51.6	15.5	0	11	0	11	2	5	25	16	48	4.8	16	30	46	4.8	50.6	4
EGR with diesel particulate filter (10% uptake on heavy-duty vehicles) (HIGH COST ESTIMATE)	44	24	68.6	20.6	5	23	1	6	10	7	51.6	15.5	0	11	0	11	2	5	25	16	48	4.8	16	30	46	4.8	47.5	13
Euro 5 uptake in 2010 (Scenario C)	57	24	81.2	24.4	1	15	0	0	5	6	27.4	8.2	0	11	0	11	2	5	25	24	54	5.4	16	30	46	4.8	44.8	18
Low emission passenger cars (10% of new car sales)	41	30	70.3	21.1	1	4	1	6	5	15	31.4	9.4	5	11	0	16	3	5	25	24	54	5.4	32	60	82	9.2	48.4	11
Low emission passenger cars (40% of new car sales)	0	40	40.0	12.0	4	16	1	9	15	30	74.8	22.5	5	11	0	16	3	5	25	24	54	5.4	32	15	47	4.7	47.8	12
Hybrid-electric buses (Low CO <sub>2</sub> hybrid) (2% of bus fleet by 2010)	58	25	82.6	24.8	0	0	1	6	5	8	19.8	5.9	10	11	0	21	4	5	25	24	54	5.4	40	30	70	7.0	47.4	14
Hybrid-electric buses (Low NOx / PM <sub>10</sub> hybrid) (2% of bus fleet by 2010)	58	25	82.5	24.8	0	0	1	6	5	8	19.7	5.9	10	11	0	21	4	5	25	24	54	5.4	40	30	70	7.0	47.3	15
Re-engining heavy duty vehicles with CNG/LNG engines (2% of Heavy Duty Vehicles by 2010)	55	26	80.9	24.3	1	3	1	6	15	0	26.1	7.8	10	11	0	21	4	5	25	0	30	3.0	8	0	8	0.8	40.2	21
Increased uptake of biofuels (5.00% of fuel sales)	60	8	88.4	20.5	0	0	0	0	0	16	16.4	4.8	0	11	0	11	2	5	25	24	54	5.4	24	30	54	5.4	38.5	22
Increased uptake of biofuels (to meet 5.75% EU target level)	60	0	60.0	18.0	0	0	0	0	0	21	20.6	6.2	0	11	0	11	2	5	25	24	54	5.4	16	30	46	4.8	36.4	25
Water Diesel Emulsion (50% of buses and 2% of HGVs by 2010)	60	23	83.4	25.0	2	9	0	0	5	8	23.8	7.1	0	11	0	11	2	5	25	24	54	5.4	24	45	89	8.9	46.7	16
Water Diesel Emulsion (all buses and 10% of HGVs from 2006)	60	21	81.3	24.4	5	20	0	0	10	8	41.9	12.6	0	11	0	11	2	5	25	24	54	5.4	24	30	54	5.4	50.0	5
Scrappage scheme (LOW COST ESTIMATE)	60	14	73.8	22.1	10	35	0	3	5	8	90.8	18.3	0	11	0	11	2	5	25	16	48	4.8	32	15	47	4.7	51.9	2
Scrappage scheme (HIGH COST ESTIMATE)	60	2	62.3	18.7	10	35	0	3	5	8	90.8	18.3	0	11	0	11	2	5	25	16	48	4.8	32	15	47	4.7	48.5	10
Low Emission Zones (LOW COST ESTIMATE)	53	24	77.3	23.2	1	24	0	3	5	8	40.7	12.2	0	11	0	11	2	5	25	8	38	3.8	16	30	46	4.8	46.0	17
Low Emission Zones (HIGH COST ESTIMATE)	45	24	69.9	21.0	1	24	0	3	5	8	40.7	12.2	0	11	0	11	2	5	25	8	36	3.8	16	30	46	4.8	43.8	19
Access control measures – restrictions on private cars in urban areas	59	25	84.2	25.3	0	0	0	3	5	8	18.4	4.9	5	45	45	86	18	0	50	24	74	7.4	8	15	33	3.3	58.9	1
Lorry road user charging scheme	60	25	84.8	25.4	0	0	0	3	5	9	17.3	5.2	0	11	0	11	2	5	0	24	29	2.9	32	30	62	6.2	42.0	20
Public transport priority measures (bus lanes and guided busways) (LOW ESTIMATE)	58	25	83.3	25.0	0	0	0	3	5	8	18.9	4.8	0	23	0	23	5	10	50	40	100	10.0	24	30	54	5.4	49.7	6
Public transport priority measures (bus lanes and guided busways) (HIGH ESTIMATE)	58	25	82.5	24.8	0	1	0	3	5	8	18.6	5.0	0	23	0	23	5	10	50	40	100	10.0	24	30	54	5.4	49.6	7
Speed policy review (motorways) (LOW COST ESTIMATE)	60	25	84.7	25.4	1	1	0	3	5	8	18.4	5.5	10	0	0	10	2	5	25	24	54	5.4	0	0	0	0.0	38.3	23
Speed policy review (motorways) (HIGH COST ESTIMATE)	59	25	83.8	25.1	1	1	0	3	5	8	18.4	5.5	10	0	0	10	2	5	25	24	54	5.4	0	0	0	0.0	38.1	24
Car clubs / car sharing schemes	60	25	84.5	25.3	0	0	0	3	5	8	18.4	4.9	0	23	0	23	5	10	50	32	92	9.2	16	30	46	4.8	48.6	9

Figure A.1: Detailed results from MCA run A1 (2005-2010 time period)

Options	Costs			Emissions						Traffic impacts			Social impacts			Feasibility			Total score	Rank								
	Annualised capital cost	Annual operating cost		NOx emissions	PM <sub>10</sub> emissions	CO emissions	HC emissions	Ground level ozone	CO <sub>2</sub> emissions	Noise	Congestion	Accident rate	Social cohesion	Quality of life	Distribution effects	Public acceptability	Practicality											
Performance criteria weighting factors	50	50	100	20	20	10	10	10	30	100	30	30	40	100	30	40	30	100	60	50	100	500						
Theme weighting factors	20			20						8			8			20			100									
SCR with diesel particulate filter (10% uptake on heavy-duty vehicles) (LOW COST ESTIMATE)	45	30	74.8	20.9	14	13	7	3	10	8	56.2	15.5	0	8	0	8	1	15	20	12	47	3.8	20	25	46	12.6	53.4	6
SCR with diesel particulate filter (10% uptake on heavy-duty vehicles) (HIGH COST ESTIMATE)	37	30	88.9	18.7	14	13	7	3	10	8	56.2	15.5	0	8	0	8	1	15	20	12	47	3.8	20	25	46	12.6	51.2	12
EGR with diesel particulate filter (10% uptake on heavy-duty vehicles) (LOW COST ESTIMATE)	45	30	75.8	21.2	10	13	7	7	7	7	48.9	14.0	0	8	0	8	1	15	20	12	47	3.8	20	25	46	12.6	52.1	7
EGR with diesel particulate filter (10% uptake on heavy-duty vehicles) (HIGH COST ESTIMATE)	37	30	87.3	18.8	10	13	7	7	7	7	48.9	14.0	0	8	0	8	1	15	20	12	47	3.8	20	25	46	12.6	49.8	14
Euro 5 uptake in 2010 (Scenario C)	48	30	77.8	21.3	3	8	0	0	3	6	20.8	5.8	0	8	0	8	1	15	20	18	53	4.2	20	25	46	12.6	45.0	19
Low emission passenger cars (10% of new car sales)	34	37	71.0	18.8	2	2	7	7	3	15	35.6	10.0	15	8	0	23	2	15	20	18	53	4.2	40	50	80	25.2	61.1	1
Low emission passenger cars (40% of new car sales)	0	50	50.0	14.0	7	9	10	10	10	30	79.4	21.4	15	8	0	23	2	15	20	18	53	4.2	40	13	53	14.7	56.1	4
Hybrid-electric buses (Low CO <sub>2</sub> hybrid) (2% of bus fleet by 2010)	48	31	79.2	22.2	0	0	7	7	3	8	24.8	6.9	30	8	0	36	3	15	20	18	53	4.2	50	25	75	21.6	57.4	2
Hybrid-electric buses (Low NOx / PM <sub>10</sub> hybrid) (2% of bus fleet by 2010)	48	31	79.1	22.2	0	0	7	7	3	8	24.7	6.9	30	8	0	36	3	15	20	18	53	4.2	50	25	76	21.6	57.3	3
Re-engining heavy duty vehicles with CNG/LNG engines (2% of Heavy Duty Vehicles by 2010)	46	32	79.2	21.9	2	2	7	7	10	0	27.2	7.6	30	8	0	36	3	15	20	0	35	2.8	10	0	10	2.8	38.1	22
Increased uptake of biofuels (5.00% of fuel sales)	50	11	85.6	17.0	0	0	0	0	0	16	16.4	4.6	0	8	0	8	1	15	20	18	53	4.2	30	25	56	15.4	41.8	21
Increased uptake of biofuels (to meet 5.75% EU target level)	50	0	50.0	14.0	0	0	0	0	0	21	20.8	5.8	0	8	0	8	1	15	20	18	53	4.2	20	25	46	12.6	37.2	23
Water Diesel Emulsion (50% of buses and 2% of HGVs by 2010)	50	29	79.2	22.2	4	5	0	0	3	8	18.9	5.6	0	8	0	8	1	15	20	18	53	4.2	30	38	88	18.9	51.5	11
Water Diesel Emulsion (all buses and 10% of HGVs from 2006)	50	27	76.7	21.5	10	11	0	0	7	8	34.9	9.8	0	8	0	8	1	15	20	18	53	4.2	30	25	56	15.4	51.5	10
Scrappage scheme (LOW COST ESTIMATE)	50	17	88.9	18.7	20	20	3	3	3	8	57.5	16.1	0	8	0	8	1	15	20	12	47	3.8	40	13	53	14.7	53.9	5
Scrappage scheme (HIGH COST ESTIMATE)	50	3	52.9	14.8	20	20	3	3	3	8	57.5	16.1	0	8	0	8	1	15	20	12	47	3.8	40	13	53	14.7	50.0	13
Low Emission Zones (LOW COST ESTIMATE)	44	30	74.6	20.9	2	14	3	3	3	8	33.1	9.3	0	8	0	8	1	15	20	6	41	3.5	20	25	46	12.6	46.6	17
Low Emission Zones (HIGH COST ESTIMATE)	38	31	88.4	18.2	2	14	3	3	3	8	33.1	9.3	0	8	0	8	1	15	20	6	41	3.5	20	25	46	12.6	44.9	20
Access control measures – restrictions on private cars in urban areas	49	31	80.5	22.5	0	0	3	3	3	8	17.9	5.0	15	30	40	85	7	0	40	18	58	4.8	10	13	25	6.3	45.3	18
Lorry road user charging scheme	50	31	81.0	22.7	0	0	3	3	3	9	19.0	5.3	0	8	0	8	1	15	0	18	33	2.8	40	25	86	18.2	49.4	15
Public transport priority measures (bus lanes and guided busways) (LOW ESTIMATE)	49	31	79.8	22.3	0	0	3	3	3	8	17.5	4.9	0	15	0	15	1	30	40	30	100	8.0	30	25	56	15.4	51.8	8
Public transport priority measures (bus lanes and guided busways) (HIGH ESTIMATE)	48	31	79.1	22.2	0	0	3	3	3	8	18.0	5.0	0	15	0	15	1	30	40	30	100	8.0	30	25	58	15.4	51.8	9
Speed policy review (motorways) (LOW COST ESTIMATE)	50	31	80.9	22.7	3	1	3	3	3	8	20.8	5.8	30	0	0	30	2	15	20	18	53	4.2	0	0	0	0.0	35.1	24
Speed policy review (motorways) (HIGH COST ESTIMATE)	49	31	80.2	22.5	3	1	3	3	3	8	20.8	5.8	30	0	0	30	2	15	20	18	53	4.2	0	0	0	0.0	34.9	25
Car clubs / car sharing schemes	50	31	80.7	22.6	0	0	3	3	3	8	18.1	5.1	0	15	0	15	1	30	40	24	84	7.5	20	25	46	12.6	49.0	16

Figure A.2: Detailed results from MCA run A2 (2005-2010 time period)

Options	Costs			Emissions						Traffic impacts			Social impacts			Feasibility			Total score	Rank							
	Annualised capital cost	Annual operating cost		NOx emissions	PM <sub>10</sub> emissions	CO emissions	HC emissions	Ground level ozone	CO <sub>2</sub> emissions	Noise	Congestion	Accident rate	Social cohesion	Quality of life	Distribution effects	Public acceptability	Practicality										
Performance criteria weighting factors	60	40	100	20	20	0	5	5	50	100	20	40	40	100	33	33	33	100	60	50	100	500					
Theme weighting factors			35										10					5			15	100					
SCR with diesel particulate filter (10% uptake on heavy-duty vehicles) (LOW COST ESTIMATE)	54	24	77.7	14	13	0	2	5	13	48.9	16.4	0	10	0	10	1	17	17	13	47	2.3	20	25	40	6.8	53.7	3
SCR with diesel particulate filter (10% uptake on heavy-duty vehicles) (HIGH COST ESTIMATE)	44	24	88.3	14	13	0	2	5	13	48.9	16.4	0	10	0	10	1	17	17	13	47	2.3	20	25	40	6.8	50.4	11
EGR with diesel particulate filter (10% uptake on heavy-duty vehicles) (LOW COST ESTIMATE)	55	24	78.8	10	13	0	3	3	11	40.9	14.3	0	10	0	10	1	17	17	13	47	2.3	20	25	40	6.8	52.0	9
EGR with diesel particulate filter (10% uptake on heavy-duty vehicles) (HIGH COST ESTIMATE)	44	24	88.8	10	13	0	3	3	11	40.9	14.3	0	10	0	10	1	17	17	13	47	2.3	20	25	40	6.8	48.4	17
Euro 5 uptake in 2010 (Scenario C)	57	24	81.2	3	8	0	0	2	10	23.3	8.2	0	10	0	10	1	17	17	20	53	2.7	20	25	40	6.8	47.0	19
Low emission passenger cars (10% of new car sales)	41	30	75.3	2	2	0	3	2	25	33.7	11.8	10	10	0	20	2	17	17	20	53	2.7	40	50	80	13.5	54.6	2
Low emission passenger cars (40% of new car sales)	0	40	40.0	7	9	0	5	5	50	78.4	26.7	10	10	0	20	2	17	17	20	53	2.7	40	13	53	7.8	53.3	4
Hybrid-electric buses (Low CO <sub>2</sub> hybrid) (2% of bus fleet by 2010)	58	25	82.6	0	0	0	3	2	13	18.3	6.4	20	10	0	30	3	17	17	20	53	2.7	50	25	75	11.3	52.3	7
Hybrid-electric buses (Low NOx / PM <sub>10</sub> hybrid) (2% of bus fleet by 2010)	58	25	82.5	0	0	0	3	2	13	18.0	6.3	20	10	0	30	3	17	17	20	53	2.7	50	25	76	11.3	52.1	8
Re-engining heavy duty vehicles with CNG/LNG engines (2% of Heavy Duty Vehicles by 2010)	55	26	80.9	2	2	0	3	5	0	12.2	4.3	20	10	0	30	3	17	17	0	33	1.7	10	0	10	1.5	38.8	25
Increased uptake of biofuels (5.00% of fuel sales)	60	8	88.4	0	0	0	0	0	27	27.3	9.8	0	10	0	10	1	17	17	20	53	2.7	30	25	56	9.3	45.4	20
Increased uptake of biofuels (to meet 5.75% EU target level)	60	0	60.0	0	0	0	0	0	34	34.3	12.0	0	10	0	10	1	17	17	20	53	2.7	20	25	40	6.8	43.4	22
Water Diesel Emulsion (50% of buses and 2% of HGVs by 2010)	60	23	83.4	4	5	0	0	2	13	23.2	8.1	0	10	0	10	1	17	17	20	53	2.7	30	38	88	10.1	51.1	10
Water Diesel Emulsion (all buses and 10% of HGVs from 2006)	60	21	81.3	10	11	0	0	3	13	38.6	12.9	0	10	0	10	1	17	17	20	53	2.7	30	25	56	9.3	53.2	5
Scrappage scheme (LOW COST ESTIMATE)	60	14	73.6	20	20	0	2	2	13	55.8	19.5	0	10	0	10	1	17	17	13	47	2.3	40	13	53	7.9	56.5	1
Scrappage scheme (HIGH COST ESTIMATE)	60	2	62.3	20	20	0	2	2	13	55.8	19.5	0	10	0	10	1	17	17	13	47	2.3	40	13	53	7.9	52.6	6
Low Emission Zones (LOW COST ESTIMATE)	53	24	77.3	2	14	0	2	2	13	31.4	11.0	0	10	0	10	1	17	17	7	40	2.0	20	25	40	6.8	47.8	18
Low Emission Zones (HIGH COST ESTIMATE)	45	24	89.9	2	14	0	2	2	13	31.4	11.0	0	10	0	10	1	17	17	7	40	2.0	20	25	40	6.8	45.2	21
Access control measures – restrictions on private cars in urban areas	59	25	84.2	0	0	0	2	2	13	18.2	5.7	10	40	40	80	8	0	33	20	53	2.7	10	13	23	3.4	50.2	12
Lorry road user charging scheme	60	25	84.8	0	0	0	2	2	14	18.0	6.3	0	10	0	10	1	17	0	20	37	1.8	40	25	80	9.8	48.6	16
Public transport priority measures (bus lanes and guided busways) (LOW ESTIMATE)	58	25	83.3	0	0	0	2	2	13	15.9	5.6	0	20	0	20	2	33	33	33	100	8.0	30	25	56	9.3	50.0	13
Public transport priority measures (bus lanes and guided busways) (HIGH ESTIMATE)	58	25	82.5	0	0	0	2	2	13	16.3	5.7	0	20	0	20	2	33	33	33	100	8.0	30	25	56	9.3	49.9	14
Speed policy review (motorways) (LOW COST ESTIMATE)	60	25	84.7	3	1	0	2	2	13	19.1	6.7	20	0	0	20	2	17	17	20	53	2.7	0	0	0	0.0	41.0	23
Speed policy review (motorways) (HIGH COST ESTIMATE)	59	25	83.8	3	1	0	2	2	13	18.1	6.7	20	0	0	20	2	17	17	20	53	2.7	0	0	0	0.0	40.7	24
Car clubs / car sharing schemes	60	25	84.3	0	0	0	2	2	13	16.7	5.9	0	20	0	20	2	33	33	27	93	4.7	20	25	40	6.8	48.8	15

Figure A.3: Detailed results from MCA run A3 (2005-2010 time period)

Options	Costs			Emissions						Traffic impacts			Social impacts			Feasibility		Total score	Rank							
	Annualised capital cost	Annual operating cost		NOx emissions	PM <sub>10</sub> emissions	CO emissions	HC emissions	Ground level ozone	CO <sub>2</sub> emissions	Noise	Congestion	Accident rate	Social cohesion	Quality of life	Distribution effects	Public acceptability	Practicality									
Performance criteria weighting factors	60	40	100	29	29	1	2	10	29	100	80	10	10	5	15	80	60	40	100	500						
Theme weighting factors	20			46						5			5			25		100								
SCR with diesel particulate filter (10% uptake on heavy-duty vehicles) (LOW COST ESTIMATE)	54	24	77.7 15.5	21	19	1	1	10	7	58.8 26.6	0	3	0	3	0	3	8	32	42	2.1	24	20	44	11.0	55.2	4
SCR with diesel particulate filter (10% uptake on heavy-duty vehicles) (HIGH COST ESTIMATE)	44	24	88.3 13.7	21	19	1	1	10	7	58.8 26.6	0	3	0	3	0	3	8	32	42	2.1	24	20	44	11.0	53.3	5
EGR with diesel particulate filter (10% uptake on heavy-duty vehicles) (LOW COST ESTIMATE)	55	24	78.8 15.8	14	19	1	1	7	6	48.8 22.0	0	3	0	3	0	3	8	32	42	2.1	24	20	44	11.0	50.9	8
EGR with diesel particulate filter (10% uptake on heavy-duty vehicles) (HIGH COST ESTIMATE)	44	24	88.8 13.7	14	19	1	1	7	6	48.8 22.0	0	3	0	3	0	3	8	32	42	2.1	24	20	44	11.0	48.9	11
Euro 5 uptake in 2010 (Scenario C)	57	24	81.2 14.2	4	12	0	0	3	6	26.7 11.8	0	3	0	3	0	3	8	48	58	2.8	24	20	44	11.0	41.8	15
Low emission passenger cars (10% of new car sales)	41	30	70.3 14.1	3	3	1	1	3	14	25.6 11.5	40	3	0	43	2	3	8	48	58	2.8	48	40	88	22.0	52.6	7
Low emission passenger cars (40% of new car sales)	0	40	40.0 8.0	10	14	1	2	10	29	65.8 29.8	40	3	0	43	2	3	8	48	58	2.8	48	10	58	14.5	57.1	3
Hybrid-electric buses (Low CO <sub>2</sub> hybrid) (2% of bus fleet by 2010)	58	25	82.6 16.5	0	0	1	1	3	8	13.3 6.0	80	3	0	83	4	3	8	48	58	2.8	60	20	80	20.0	49.5	9
Hybrid-electric buses (Low NOx / PM <sub>10</sub> hybrid) (2% of bus fleet by 2010)	58	25	82.5 16.5	0	0	1	1	3	7	13.3 6.0	80	3	0	83	4	3	8	48	58	2.8	60	20	80	20.0	49.5	10
Re-engining heavy duty vehicles with CNG/LNG engines (2% of Heavy Duty Vehicles by 2010)	55	26	80.9 16.2	3	3	1	1	10	0	17.7 7.9	80	3	0	83	4	3	8	0	10	0.5	12	0	12	3.0	31.8	23
Increased uptake of biofuels (5.00% of fuel sales)	60	8	88.4 13.7	0	0	0	0	0	16	15.9 7.1	0	3	0	3	0	3	8	48	58	2.8	36	20	56	14.0	37.9	19
Increased uptake of biofuels (to meet 5.75% EU target level)	60	0	60.0 12.0	0	0	0	0	0	20	18.9 8.9	0	3	0	3	0	3	8	48	58	2.8	24	20	44	11.0	35.0	21
Water Diesel Emulsion (50% of buses and 2% of HGVs by 2010)	60	23	83.4 16.7	5	8	0	0	3	7	23.7 10.7	0	3	0	3	0	3	8	48	58	2.8	36	30	66	16.5	46.9	12
Water Diesel Emulsion (all buses and 10% of HGVs from 2006)	60	21	81.3 16.3	14	16	0	0	7	7	44.0 19.9	0	3	0	3	0	3	8	48	58	2.8	36	20	56	14.0	53.1	6
Scrappage scheme (LOW COST ESTIMATE)	60	14	73.6 14.7	29	29	0	1	3	7	69.6 31.3	0	3	0	3	0	3	8	32	42	2.1	48	10	58	14.5	62.8	1
Scrappage scheme (HIGH COST ESTIMATE)	60	2	62.3 12.5	29	29	0	1	3	7	69.6 31.3	0	3	0	3	0	3	8	32	42	2.1	48	10	58	14.5	60.5	2
Low Emission Zones (LOW COST ESTIMATE)	53	24	77.3 15.5	3	20	0	1	3	7	34.2 15.4	0	3	0	3	0	3	8	16	28	1.5	24	20	44	11.0	43.3	13
Low Emission Zones (HIGH COST ESTIMATE)	45	24	89.9 14.0	3	20	0	1	3	7	34.2 15.4	0	3	0	3	0	3	8	16	28	1.5	24	20	44	11.0	41.8	16
Access control measures – restrictions on private cars in urban areas	59	25	84.2 16.8	0	0	0	1	3	7	12.1 5.5	40	10	10	80	3	0	15	48	63	3.2	12	10	22	5.5	33.9	22
Lorry road user charging scheme	60	25	84.9 17.0	0	0	0	1	3	8	13.2 5.9	0	3	0	3	0	3	0	48	51	2.5	48	20	88	17.0	42.6	14
Public transport priority measures (bus lanes and guided busways) (LOW ESTIMATE)	58	25	83.3 16.3	0	0	0	1	3	7	11.6 5.2	0	5	0	5	0	5	15	80	100	5.0	36	20	56	14.0	41.2	18
Public transport priority measures (bus lanes and guided busways) (HIGH ESTIMATE)	58	25	82.5 16.5	0	1	0	1	3	7	12.3 5.5	0	5	0	5	0	5	15	80	100	5.0	36	20	56	14.0	41.3	17
Speed policy review (motorways) (LOW COST ESTIMATE)	60	25	84.7 16.9	4	1	0	1	3	7	16.3 7.4	80	0	0	80	4	3	8	48	58	2.8	0	0	0	0.0	31.2	24
Speed policy review (motorways) (HIGH COST ESTIMATE)	59	25	83.8 16.8	4	1	0	1	3	7	16.3 7.4	80	0	0	80	4	3	8	48	58	2.8	0	0	0	0.0	31.0	25
Car clubs / car sharing schemes	60	25	84.5 16.9	0	0	0	1	3	8	12.2 5.5	0	5	0	5	0	5	15	64	84	4.2	24	20	44	11.0	37.8	20

Figure A.4: Detailed results from MCA run A4 (2005-2010 time period)

Options	Costs			Emissions							Traffic impacts			Social impacts			Feasibility			Total score	Rank							
	Annualised capital cost	Annual operating cost		NOx emissions	PM <sub>10</sub> emissions	CO emissions	HC emissions	Ground level ozone	CO <sub>2</sub> emissions	Noise	Congestion	Accident rate	Social cohesion	Quality of life	Distribution effects	Public acceptability	Practicality											
Performance criteria weighting factors	60	40	100	17	32	4	6	14	27	100	25	35	40	100	30	40	30	100	40	60	100	500						
Theme weighting factors			30							30			15			10		15			100							
SCR with diesel particulate filter (10% uptake on heavy-duty vehicles) (LOW COST ESTIMATE)	54	24	77.7	23.3	12	21	3	2	14	7	58.0	17.7	0	9	0	8	1	15	20	12	47	4.7	16	30	46	8.8	53.9	2
SCR with diesel particulate filter (10% uptake on heavy-duty vehicles) (HIGH COST ESTIMATE)	44	24	88.3	20.5	12	21	3	2	14	7	58.0	17.7	0	9	0	8	1	15	20	12	47	4.7	16	30	46	8.8	51.1	9
EGR with diesel particulate filter (10% uptake on heavy-duty vehicles) (LOW COST ESTIMATE)	55	24	78.8	23.8	8	21	3	4	9	6	51.7	15.5	0	9	0	8	1	15	20	12	47	4.7	16	30	46	8.8	52.1	5
EGR with diesel particulate filter (10% uptake on heavy-duty vehicles) (HIGH COST ESTIMATE)	44	24	88.8	20.8	8	21	3	4	9	6	51.7	15.5	0	9	0	8	1	15	20	12	47	4.7	16	30	46	8.8	49.0	14
Euro 5 uptake in 2010 (Scenario C)	57	24	81.2	24.4	2	13	0	0	5	6	26.1	7.8	0	9	0	8	1	15	20	18	53	5.3	16	30	46	8.8	45.7	18
Low emission passenger cars (10% of new car sales)	41	30	75.3	21.1	2	4	3	4	5	13	29.9	9.0	13	9	0	21	3	15	20	18	53	5.3	32	60	80	13.8	52.3	3
Low emission passenger cars (40% of new car sales)	0	40	40.0	12.0	6	15	4	6	14	27	71.9	21.8	13	9	0	21	3	15	20	18	53	5.3	32	15	47	7.1	49.1	13
Hybrid-electric buses (Low CO <sub>2</sub> hybrid) (2% of bus fleet by 2010)	58	25	82.6	24.8	0	0	3	4	5	7	18.7	5.8	25	9	0	34	5	15	20	18	53	5.3	40	30	70	10.5	51.3	7
Hybrid-electric buses (Low NOx / PM <sub>10</sub> hybrid) (2% of bus fleet by 2010)	58	25	82.5	24.8	0	0	3	4	5	7	18.7	5.8	25	9	0	34	5	15	20	18	53	5.3	40	30	70	10.5	51.2	8
Re-engining heavy duty vehicles with CNG/LNG engines (2% of Heavy Duty Vehicles by 2010)	55	26	80.9	24.3	2	3	3	4	14	0	25.5	7.8	25	9	0	34	5	15	20	0	35	3.5	8	0	6	1.2	41.7	21
Increased uptake of biofuels (5.00% of fuel sales)	60	8	88.4	20.5	0	0	0	0	0	15	14.8	4.4	0	9	0	8	1	15	20	18	53	5.3	24	30	54	8.1	39.7	23
Increased uptake of biofuels (to meet 5.75% EU target level)	60	0	60.0	18.0	0	0	0	0	0	19	18.5	5.8	0	9	0	8	1	15	20	18	53	5.3	16	30	46	8.8	37.1	25
Water Diesel Emulsion (50% of buses and 2% of HGVs by 2010)	60	23	83.4	25.0	3	9	0	0	5	7	23.1	8.9	0	9	0	8	1	15	20	18	53	5.3	24	45	88	10.4	48.9	15
Water Diesel Emulsion (all buses and 10% of HGVs from 2006)	60	21	81.3	24.4	8	18	0	0	9	7	42.1	12.6	0	9	0	8	1	15	20	18	53	5.3	24	30	54	8.1	51.8	6
Scrappage scheme (LOW COST ESTIMATE)	60	14	73.6	22.1	17	32	1	2	5	7	63.8	19.1	0	9	0	8	1	15	20	12	47	4.7	32	15	47	7.1	54.3	1
Scrappage scheme (HIGH COST ESTIMATE)	60	2	62.3	18.7	17	32	1	2	5	7	63.8	19.1	0	9	0	8	1	15	20	12	47	4.7	32	15	47	7.1	60.9	10
Low Emission Zones (LOW COST ESTIMATE)	53	24	77.3	23.2	2	22	1	2	5	7	38.2	11.5	0	9	0	8	1	15	20	6	41	4.1	16	30	46	8.8	47.0	17
Low Emission Zones (HIGH COST ESTIMATE)	45	24	89.9	21.0	2	22	1	2	5	7	38.2	11.5	0	9	0	8	1	15	20	6	41	4.1	16	30	46	8.8	44.7	19
Access control measures – restrictions on private cars in urban areas	59	25	84.2	25.3	0	0	1	2	5	7	15.3	4.8	13	35	40	88	13	0	40	18	58	5.8	8	15	23	3.5	52.2	4
Lorry road user charging scheme	60	25	84.8	25.4	0	0	1	2	5	8	16.2	4.9	0	9	0	8	1	15	0	18	33	3.3	32	30	62	9.3	44.2	20
Public transport priority measures (bus lanes and guided busways) (LOW ESTIMATE)	58	25	83.3	25.0	0	0	1	2	5	7	14.8	4.4	0	18	0	18	3	30	40	30	100	10.0	24	30	54	8.1	50.2	11
Public transport priority measures (bus lanes and guided busways) (HIGH ESTIMATE)	58	25	82.5	24.8	0	1	1	2	5	7	15.5	4.8	0	18	0	18	3	30	40	30	100	10.0	24	30	54	8.1	50.1	12
Speed policy review (motorways) (LOW COST ESTIMATE)	60	25	84.7	25.4	2	1	1	2	5	7	18.1	5.4	25	0	0	25	4	15	20	18	53	5.3	0	0	0	0.0	39.9	22
Speed policy review (motorways) (HIGH COST ESTIMATE)	59	25	83.8	25.1	2	1	1	2	5	7	18.1	5.4	25	0	0	25	4	15	20	18	53	5.3	0	0	0	0.0	39.6	24
Car clubs / car sharing schemes	60	25	84.3	25.3	0	0	1	2	5	7	15.3	4.8	0	18	0	18	3	30	40	24	84	8.4	16	30	46	8.8	48.8	18

Figure A.5: Detailed results from MCA run A5 (2005-2010 time period)

Options	Costs			Emissions							Traffic impacts				Social impacts			Feasibility			Total score	Rank							
	Annualised capital cost	Annual operating cost		NOx emissions abatement	PM <sub>10</sub> emissions abatement	CO emissions	HC emissions	Ground level ozone	CO <sub>2</sub> emissions	Noise	Congestion	Accident rate	Social cohesion	Quality of life	Distribution effects	Public/industry acceptability	Practicality												
Performance criteria weighting factors	50	50	100	8	35	0	5	12	40	100	10	45	45	100	10	50	40	100	40	60	100	500							
Theme weighting factors			25							35				20				10			10	100							
Battery-powered electric Vehicles	15	27	42	10	15	11	1	3	15	35	80	28	30	0	0	30	6	0	17	33	50	5	13	20	33	3	52.6	1	
H <sub>2</sub> fuel cell vehicles for Captive fleets	0	13	13	3	15	11	1	3	15	18	62	22	30	0	0	30	6	0	17	33	50	5	0	10	10	1	37.1	6	
New diesel formulations	30	40	70	18	0	11	0	0	0	18	29	10	0	0	0	0	0	0	17	33	50	5	40	60	100	10	42.5	4	
Scrappage scheme for Euro 2, Euro 3 and Euro 4 vehicles	60	0	60	15	7	0	1	1	8	0	17	6	0	0	0	0	0	0	17	22	39	4	13	0	13	1	26.1	11	
Road user charging (all Vehicles and all roads)	0	0	0	0	15	11	1	3	15	35	80	28	10	35	35	80	16	0	17	11	28	3	7	10	17	2	48.3	2	
Extended Low Emissions Zones	15	0	15	4	22	22	2	4	15	18	83	29	0	0	0	0	0	0	17	11	28	3	0	10	10	1	36.4	8	
Freight distribution centres and intermodal freight transfer	15	13	28	7	7	0	1	1	8	18	34	12	10	35	0	45	9	0	17	33	50	5	13	20	33	3	36.4	7	
Further integrated land use and transport planning	45	13	58	15	7	0	1	1	8	18	34	12	0	35	0	35	7	33	33	33	100	10	27	10	37	4	47.3	3	
Dynamic route planning	30	13	43	11	7	0	1	1	8	0	17	6	0	35	0	35	7	0	17	33	50	5	27	40	67	7	35.4	9	
Emissions Trading Scheme for Heavy-duty vehicles and taxis	45	13	58	15	7	0	1	1	8	35	52	18	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	10	10	1	33.7	10
Personal Carbon Accounts	45	0	45	11	7	0	1	1	8	35	52	18	0	35	0	35	7	0	0	33	33	3	0	10	10	1	40.7	5	

Figure A.6: Detailed results from MCA run B1 (2011-2025 time period)

Options	Costs				Emissions							Traffic impacts				Social impacts				Feasibility			Total score	Rank				
	Annualised capital cost	Annual operating cost			NOx emissions abatement	PM10 emissions abatement	CO emissions	HC emissions	Ground level ozone	CO2 emissions			Noise	Congestion	Accident rate			Social cohesion	Quality of life	Distribution effects		Public/industry acceptability			Practicality			
Performance criteria weighting factors	50	50	100		20	20	10	10	10	30	100		30	30	40	100		30	40	30	100	50	50	100	500			
Theme weighting factors				28							28					8					8				28	100		
Battery-powered electric Vehicles	15	27	42	12	15	11	1	3	15	35	80	22	30	0	0	30	2	0	17	33	50	4	13	20	33	9	49.7	2
H <sub>2</sub> fuel cell vehicles for Captive fleets	0	13	13	4	15	11	1	3	15	18	62	17	30	0	0	30	2	0	17	33	50	4	0	10	10	3	30.3	10
New diesel formulations	30	40	70	20	0	11	0	0	0	18	29	8	0	0	0	0	0	0	17	33	50	4	40	60	100	28	59.6	1
Scrappage scheme for Euro 2, Euro 3 and Euro 4 vehicles	60	0	60	17	7	0	1	1	8	0	17	5	0	0	0	0	0	0	17	22	39	3	13	0	13	4	28.4	11
Road user charging (all Vehicles and all roads)	0	0	0	0	15	11	1	3	15	35	80	22	10	35	35	80	6	0	17	11	28	2	7	10	17	5	35.6	5
Extended Low Emissions Zones	15	0	15	4	22	22	2	4	15	18	83	23	0	0	0	0	0	0	17	11	28	2	0	10	10	3	32.3	9
Freight distribution centres and intermodal freight transfer	15	13	28	8	7	0	1	1	8	18	34	10	10	35	0	45	4	0	17	33	50	4	13	20	33	9	34.5	7
Further integrated land use and transport planning	45	13	58	16	7	0	1	1	8	18	34	10	0	35	0	35	3	33	33	33	100	8	27	10	37	10	47.0	3
Dynamic route planning	30	13	43	12	7	0	1	1	8	0	17	5	0	35	0	35	3	0	17	33	50	4	27	40	67	19	42.3	4
Emissions Trading Scheme for Heavy-duty vehicles and taxis	45	13	58	16	7	0	1	1	8	35	52	15	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	10	10	3	33.6	8
Personal Carbon Accounts	45	0	45	13	7	0	1	1	8	35	52	15	0	35	0	35	3	0	0	33	33	3	0	10	10	3	35.4	6

Figure A.7: Detailed results from MCA run B2 (2011-2025 time period)



Options	Costs				Emissions							Traffic impacts				Social impacts			Feasibility			Total score	Rank						
	Annualised capital cost	Annual operating cost			NOx emissions abatement	PM <sub>10</sub> emissions abatement	CO emissions	HC emissions	Ground level ozone	CO <sub>2</sub> emissions		Noise	Congestion	Accident rate		Social cohesion	Quality of life	Distribution effects		Public/industry acceptability	Practicality								
Performance criteria weighting factors	60	40	100		20	20	0	5	5	50	100	20	40	40	100	33	33	33	100	50	50	100	500						
Theme weighting factors				35							35				10				5			15	100						
Battery-powered electric Vehicles	15	27	42	15	15	11	1	3	15	35	80	28	30	0	0	30	3	0	17	33	50	2	13	20	33	5	53.0	1	
H <sub>2</sub> fuel cell vehicles for Captive fleets	0	13	13	5	15	11	1	3	15	18	62	22	30	0	0	30	3	0	17	33	50	2	0	10	10	2	33.4	10	
New diesel formulations	30	40	70	25	0	11	0	0	0	18	29	10	0	0	0	0	0	0	17	33	50	2	40	60	100	15	52.0	2	
Scrappage scheme for Euro 2, Euro 3 and Euro 4 vehicles	60	0	60	21	7	0	1	1	8	0	17	6	0	0	0	0	0	0	17	22	39	2	13	0	13	2	30.8	11	
Road user charging (all Vehicles and all roads)	0	0	0	0	15	11	1	3	15	35	80	28	10	35	35	80	8	0	17	11	28	1	7	10	17	3	39.8	6	
Extended Low Emissions Zones	15	0	15	5	22	22	2	4	15	18	83	29	0	0	0	0	0	0	17	11	28	1	0	10	10	2	37.0	8	
Freight distribution centres and intermodal freight transfer	15	13	28	10	7	0	1	1	8	18	34	12	10	35	0	45	5	0	17	33	50	2	13	20	33	5	33.9	9	
Further integrated land use and transport planning	45	13	58	20	7	0	1	1	8	18	34	12	0	35	0	35	4	33	33	33	100	5	27	10	37	6	46.4	3	
Dynamic route planning	30	13	43	15	7	0	1	1	8	0	17	6	0	35	0	35	4	0	17	33	50	2	27	40	67	10	37.1	7	
Emissions Trading Scheme for Heavy-duty vehicles and taxis	45	13	58	20	7	0	1	1	8	35	52	18	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	10	10	2	40.1	5
Personal Carbon Accounts	45	0	45	16	7	0	1	1	8	35	52	18	0	35	0	35	4	0	0	33	33	2	0	10	10	2	40.6	4	

Figure A.8: Detailed results from MCA run B3 (2011-2025 time period)

Options	Costs				Emissions							Traffic impacts				Social impacts				Feasibility			Total score	Rank				
	Annualised capital cost	Annual operating cost			NOx emissions abatement	PM <sub>10</sub> emissions abatement	CO emissions	HC emissions	Ground level ozone	CO <sub>2</sub> emissions			Noise	Congestion	Accident rate			Social cohesion	Quality of life	Distribution effects		Public/industry acceptability			Practicality			
Performance criteria weighting factors	60	40	100		24	31	1	3	10	31	100		80	10	10	100		5	15	80	100	60	40	100	500			
Theme weighting factors				20							45					5					5				25	100		
Battery-powered electric Vehicles	15	27	42	8	15	11	1	3	15	35	80	36	30	0	0	30	2	0	17	33	50	2	13	20	33	8	56.5	1
H <sub>2</sub> fuel cell vehicles for Captive fleets	0	13	13	3	15	11	1	3	15	18	62	28	30	0	0	30	2	0	17	33	50	2	0	10	10	3	37.1	9
New diesel formulations	30	40	70	14	0	11	0	0	0	18	29	13	0	0	0	0	0	0	17	33	50	2	40	60	100	25	54.3	2
Scrappage scheme for Euro 2, Euro 3 and Euro 4 vehicles	60	0	60	12	7	0	1	1	8	0	17	8	0	0	0	0	0	0	17	22	39	2	13	0	13	3	24.9	11
Road user charging (all Vehicles and all roads)	0	0	0	0	15	11	1	3	15	35	80	36	10	35	35	80	4	0	17	11	28	1	7	10	17	4	45.4	3
Extended Low Emissions Zones	15	0	15	3	22	22	2	4	15	18	83	37	0	0	0	0	0	0	17	11	28	1	0	10	10	3	44.0	4
Freight distribution centres and intermodal freight transfer	15	13	28	6	7	0	1	1	8	18	34	15	10	35	0	45	2	0	17	33	50	2	13	20	33	8	34.2	10
Further integrated land use and transport planning	45	13	58	12	7	0	1	1	8	18	34	15	0	35	0	35	2	33	33	33	100	5	27	10	37	9	43.0	5
Dynamic route planning	30	13	43	9	7	0	1	1	8	0	17	8	0	35	0	35	2	0	17	33	50	2	27	40	67	17	37.2	8
Emissions Trading Scheme for Heavy-duty vehicles and taxis	45	13	58	12	7	0	1	1	8	35	52	23	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	10	10	3	37.5	7
Personal Carbon Accounts	45	0	45	9	7	0	1	1	8	35	52	23	0	35	0	35	2	0	0	33	33	2	0	10	10	3	38.2	6

Figure A.9: Detailed results from MCA run B4 (2011-2025 time period)

Options	Costs				Emissions							Traffic impacts				Social impacts				Feasibility				Total score	Rank			
	Annualised capital cost	Annual operating cost			NOx emissions abatement	PM10 emissions abatement	CO emissions	HC emissions	Ground level ozone	CO2 emissions			Noise	Congestion	Accident rate			Social cohesion	Quality of life	Distribution effects			Public/industry acceptability			Practicality		
<b>Performance criteria weighting factors</b>	<b>60</b>	<b>40</b>	100		<b>22</b>	<b>22</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>15</b>	<b>35</b>	100		<b>30</b>	<b>35</b>	<b>35</b>	100		<b>33</b>	<b>33</b>	<b>33</b>	100		<b>40</b>	<b>60</b>	100		<b>500</b>	
<b>Theme weighting factors</b>			<b>35</b>								<b>35</b>					<b>12</b>					<b>5</b>				<b>13</b>		<b>100</b>	
Battery-powered electric Vehicles	15	27	42	15	15	11	1	3	15	35	80	28	30	0	0	30	4	0	17	33	50	2	13	20	33	4	<b>52.9</b>	<b>1</b>
H <sub>2</sub> fuel cell vehicles for Captive fleets	0	13	13	5	15	11	1	3	15	18	62	22	30	0	0	30	4	0	17	33	50	2	0	10	10	1	<b>33.8</b>	<b>10</b>
New diesel formulations	30	40	70	25	0	11	0	0	0	18	29	10	0	0	0	0	0	0	17	33	50	2	40	60	100	13	<b>50.0</b>	<b>2</b>
Scrappage scheme for Euro 2, Euro 3 and Euro 4 vehicles	60	0	60	21	7	0	1	1	8	0	17	6	0	0	0	0	0	0	17	22	39	2	13	0	13	2	<b>30.6</b>	<b>11</b>
Road user charging (all Vehicles and all roads)	0	0	0	0	15	11	1	3	15	35	80	28	10	35	35	80	10	0	17	11	28	1	7	10	17	2	<b>41.0</b>	<b>5</b>
Extended Low Emissions Zones	15	0	15	5	22	22	2	4	15	18	83	29	0	0	0	0	0	0	17	11	28	1	0	10	10	1	<b>36.8</b>	<b>7</b>
Freight distribution centres and intermodal freight transfer	15	13	28	10	7	0	1	1	8	18	34	12	10	35	0	45	5	0	17	33	50	2	13	20	33	4	<b>34.2</b>	<b>9</b>
Further integrated land use and transport planning	45	13	58	20	7	0	1	1	8	18	34	12	0	35	0	35	4	33	33	33	100	5	27	10	37	5	<b>46.4</b>	<b>3</b>
Dynamic route planning	30	13	43	15	7	0	1	1	8	0	17	6	0	35	0	35	4	0	17	33	50	2	27	40	67	9	<b>36.4</b>	<b>8</b>
Emissions Trading Scheme for Heavy-duty vehicles and taxis	45	13	58	20	7	0	1	1	8	35	52	18	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	10	10	1	<b>39.9</b>	<b>6</b>
Personal Carbon Accounts	45	0	45	16	7	0	1	1	8	35	52	18	0	35	0	35	4	0	0	33	33	2	0	10	10	1	<b>41.1</b>	<b>4</b>

Figure A.10: Detailed results from MCA run B5 (2011-2025 time period)

Options	Costs				Emissions							Traffic impacts				Social impacts				Feasibility			Total score	Rank			
	Annualised capital cost	Annual operating cost			NOx emissions abatement	PM10 emissions abatement	CO emissions	HC emissions	Ground level ozone	CO2 emissions		Noise	Congestion	Accident rate		Social cohesion	Quality of life	Distribution effects		Public/industry acceptability	Practicality						
<b>Performance criteria weighting factors</b>	<b>40</b>	<b>60</b>	100		<b>9</b>	<b>30</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>50</b>	100	<b>10</b>	<b>45</b>	<b>45</b>	100	<b>10</b>	<b>50</b>	<b>40</b>	100	<b>50</b>	<b>50</b>	100	<b>500</b>				
<b>Theme weighting factors</b>				<b>20</b>											<b>20</b>							<b>10</b>	<b>100</b>				
Large-scale uptake of hydrogen fuel cell passenger cars	50	50	100	20	17	17	17	17	17	17	100	33	0	0	33	7	0	0	33	33	5	33	30	63	6	<b>73.0</b>	<b>1</b>
Automated Highways	17	17	33	7	6	6	6	6	6	0	28	0	33	33	67	13	0	33	33	67	10	0	0	0	0	<b>39.7</b>	<b>4</b>
Complete substitution of petrol and diesel by biofuels	33	33	67	13	0	0	0	0	0	8	8	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	33	33	5	33	40	73	7	<b>28.6</b>	<b>8</b>
Fast moving-walkways for short urban journeys	0	17	17	3	6	6	6	6	6	0	28	0	17	33	50	10	33	0	33	67	10	50	0	50	5	<b>38.1</b>	<b>6</b>
Dedicated road freight systems	0	17	17	3	6	6	6	6	6	0	28	0	17	33	50	10	0	0	33	33	5	50	0	50	5	<b>33.1</b>	<b>7</b>
Passenger cars with inter-modal functionality	33	33	67	13	6	6	6	6	6	0	28	0	33	33	67	13	0	0	33	33	5	17	0	17	2	<b>43.1</b>	<b>3</b>
Scrappage scheme for Petrol and Diesel vehicles	33	0	33	7	11	11	11	11	11	8	64	11	0	0	11	2	0	0	33	33	5	17	10	27	3	<b>38.9</b>	<b>5</b>
Fuel duty differential based on Life-cycle emissions	50	33	83	17	11	11	11	11	11	8	64	11	0	0	11	2	0	0	0	0	0	0	50	50	5	<b>46.2</b>	<b>2</b>

Figure A.11: Detailed results from MCA run C1 (2025-2050 time period)

Options	Costs				Emissions							Traffic impacts					Social impacts				Feasibility			Total score	Rank			
	Annualised capital cost	Annual operating cost			NOx emissions abatement	PM10 emissions abatement	CO emissions	HC emissions	Ground level ozone	CO2 emissions		Noise	Congestion	Accident rate			Social cohesion	Quality of life	Distribution effects		Public/industry acceptability	Practicality						
<b>Performance criteria weighting factors</b>	<b>50</b>	<b>50</b>	100		<b>20</b>	<b>20</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>30</b>	100		<b>30</b>	<b>30</b>	<b>40</b>	100		<b>30</b>	<b>40</b>	<b>30</b>	100		<b>50</b>	<b>50</b>	100		<b>500</b>	
<b>Theme weighting factors</b>				<b>28</b>												<b>8</b>							<b>8</b>			<b>28</b>	<b>100</b>	
Large-scale uptake of hydrogen fuel cell passenger cars	50	50	100	28	17	17	17	17	17	17	100	28	33	0	0	33	3	0	0	33	33	3	33	30	63	18	<b>79.1</b>	<b>1</b>
Automated Highways	17	17	33	9	6	6	6	6	6	0	28	8	0	33	33	67	5	0	33	33	67	5	0	0	0	0	<b>27.8</b>	<b>8</b>
Complete substitution of petrol and diesel by biofuels	33	33	67	19	0	0	0	0	0	8	8	2	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	33	33	3	33	40	73	21	<b>44.2</b>	<b>3</b>
Fast moving-walkways for short urban journeys	0	17	17	5	6	6	6	6	6	0	28	8	0	17	33	50	4	33	0	33	67	5	50	0	50	14	<b>35.8</b>	<b>6</b>
Dedicated road freight systems	0	17	17	5	6	6	6	6	6	0	28	8	0	17	33	50	4	0	0	33	33	3	50	0	50	14	<b>33.1</b>	<b>7</b>
Passenger cars with inter-modal functionality	33	33	67	19	6	6	6	6	6	0	28	8	0	33	33	67	5	0	0	33	33	3	17	0	17	5	<b>39.1</b>	<b>4</b>
Scrappage scheme for Petrol and Diesel vehicles	33	0	33	9	11	11	11	11	11	8	64	18	11	0	0	11	1	0	0	33	33	3	17	10	27	7	<b>38.2</b>	<b>5</b>
Fuel duty differential based on Life-cycle emissions	50	33	83	23	11	11	11	11	11	8	64	18	11	0	0	11	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	50	50	14	<b>56.1</b>	<b>2</b>

Figure A.12: Detailed results from MCA run C2 (2025-2050 time period)

Options	Costs				Emissions							Traffic impacts					Social impacts				Feasibility			Total score	Rank			
	Annualised capital cost	Annual operating cost			NOx emissions abatement	PM10 emissions abatement	CO emissions	HC emissions	Ground level ozone	CO2 emissions		Noise	Congestion	Accident rate			Social cohesion	Quality of life	Distribution effects		Public/industry acceptability	Practicality						
<b>Performance criteria weighting factors</b>	<b>60</b>	<b>40</b>	100		<b>20</b>	<b>20</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>50</b>	100		<b>20</b>	<b>40</b>	<b>40</b>	100		<b>33</b>	<b>33</b>	<b>33</b>	100		<b>50</b>	<b>50</b>	100		<b>500</b>	
<b>Theme weighting factors</b>				<b>35</b>												<b>10</b>						<b>5</b>				<b>15</b>	<b>100</b>	
Large-scale uptake of hydrogen fuel cell passenger cars	50	50	100	35	17	17	17	17	17	17	100	35	33	0	0	33	3	0	0	33	33	2	33	30	63	10	<b>84.5</b>	<b>1</b>
Automated Highways	17	17	33	12	6	6	6	6	6	0	28	10	0	33	33	67	7	0	33	33	67	3	0	0	0	0	<b>31.4</b>	<b>7</b>
Complete substitution of petrol and diesel by biofuels	33	33	67	23	0	0	0	0	0	8	8	3	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	33	33	2	33	40	73	11	<b>38.9</b>	<b>5</b>
Fast moving-walkways for short urban journeys	0	17	17	6	6	6	6	6	6	0	28	10	0	17	33	50	5	33	0	33	67	3	50	0	50	8	<b>31.4</b>	<b>6</b>
Dedicated road freight systems	0	17	17	6	6	6	6	6	6	0	28	10	0	17	33	50	5	0	0	33	33	2	50	0	50	8	<b>29.7</b>	<b>8</b>
Passenger cars with inter-modal functionality	33	33	67	23	6	6	6	6	6	0	28	10	0	33	33	67	7	0	0	33	33	2	17	0	17	3	<b>43.9</b>	<b>3</b>
Scrapage scheme for Petrol and Diesel vehicles	33	0	33	12	11	11	11	11	11	8	64	22	11	0	0	11	1	0	0	33	33	2	17	10	27	4	<b>40.8</b>	<b>4</b>
Fuel duty differential based on Life-cycle emissions	50	33	83	29	11	11	11	11	11	8	64	22	11	0	0	11	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	50	50	8	<b>60.1</b>	<b>2</b>

Figure A.13: Detailed results from MCA run C3 (2025-2050 time period)

Options	Costs			Emissions							Traffic impacts					Social impacts			Feasibility			Total score	Rank					
	Annualised capital cost	Annual operating cost		NOx emissions abatement	PM10 emissions abatement	CO emissions	HC emissions	Ground level ozone	CO2 emissions	Noise	Congestion	Accident rate	Social cohesion	Quality of life	Distribution effects	Public/industry acceptability	Practicality											
<b>Performance criteria weighting factors</b>	<b>60</b>	<b>40</b>	100	<b>16</b>	<b>35</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>35</b>	100	<b>80</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>10</b>	100	<b>5</b>	<b>15</b>	<b>80</b>	100	<b>60</b>	<b>40</b>	100	<b>500</b>						
<b>Theme weighting factors</b>			<b>20</b>							<b>45</b>				<b>5</b>				<b>5</b>			<b>25</b>	<b>100</b>						
Large-scale uptake of hydrogen fuel cell passenger cars	50	50	100	20	17	17	17	17	17	17	100	45	33	0	0	33	2	0	0	33	33	2	33	30	63	16	<b>84.2</b>	<b>1</b>
Automated Highways	17	17	33	7	6	6	6	6	6	0	28	12	0	33	33	67	3	0	33	33	67	3	0	0	0	0	<b>25.8</b>	<b>8</b>
Complete substitution of petrol and diesel by biofuels	33	33	67	13	0	0	0	0	0	8	8	4	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	33	33	2	33	40	73	18	<b>37.1</b>	<b>4</b>
Fast moving-walkways for short urban journeys	0	17	17	3	6	6	6	6	6	0	28	12	0	17	33	50	2	33	0	33	67	3	50	0	50	13	<b>34.2</b>	<b>6</b>
Dedicated road freight systems	0	17	17	3	6	6	6	6	6	0	28	12	0	17	33	50	2	0	0	33	33	2	50	0	50	13	<b>32.5</b>	<b>7</b>
Passenger cars with inter-modal functionality	33	33	67	13	6	6	6	6	6	0	28	12	0	33	33	67	3	0	0	33	33	2	17	0	17	4	<b>35.0</b>	<b>5</b>
Scrapage scheme for Petrol and Diesel vehicles	33	0	33	7	11	11	11	11	11	8	64	29	11	0	0	11	1	0	0	33	33	2	17	10	27	7	<b>44.3</b>	<b>3</b>
Fuel duty differential based on Life-cycle emissions	50	33	83	17	11	11	11	11	11	8	64	29	11	0	0	11	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	50	50	13	<b>58.5</b>	<b>2</b>

Figure A.14: Detailed results from MCA run C4 (2025-2050 time period)

Options	Costs			Emissions							Traffic impacts				Social impacts			Feasibility		Total score	Rank							
	Annualised capital cost	Annual operating cost		NOx emissions abatement	PM10 emissions abatement	CO emissions	HC emissions	Ground level ozone	CO2 emissions	Noise	Congestion	Accident rate	Social cohesion	Quality of life	Distribution effects	Public/industry acceptability	Practicality											
<b>Performance criteria weighting factors</b>	<b>40</b>	<b>60</b>	100	<b>12</b>	<b>35</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>11</b>	<b>35</b>	100	<b>30</b>	<b>35</b>	<b>35</b>	100	<b>33</b>	<b>33</b>	<b>33</b>	100	<b>60</b>	<b>40</b>	100	<b>500</b>						
<b>Theme weighting factors</b>			<b>30</b>							<b>35</b>				<b>10</b>				<b>10</b>			<b>15</b>	<b>100</b>						
Large-scale uptake of hydrogen fuel cell passenger cars	50	50	100	30	17	17	17	17	17	17	100	35	33	0	0	33	3	0	0	33	33	3	63	10	<b>81.2</b>	<b>1</b>		
Automated Highways	17	17	33	10	6	6	6	6	6	0	28	10	0	33	33	67	7	0	33	33	67	7	0	0	<b>33.1</b>	<b>7</b>		
Complete substitution of petrol and diesel by biofuels	33	33	67	20	0	0	0	0	0	8	8	3	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	33	33	3	33	40	73	11	<b>37.2</b>	<b>5</b>
Fast moving-walkways for short urban journeys	0	17	17	5	6	6	6	6	6	0	28	10	0	17	33	50	5	33	0	33	67	7	50	0	50	8	<b>33.9</b>	<b>6</b>
Dedicated road freight systems	0	17	17	5	6	6	6	6	6	0	28	10	0	17	33	50	5	0	0	33	33	3	50	0	50	8	<b>30.6</b>	<b>8</b>
Passenger cars with inter-modal functionality	33	33	67	20	6	6	6	6	6	0	28	10	0	33	33	67	7	0	0	33	33	3	17	0	17	3	<b>42.2</b>	<b>3</b>
Scrappage scheme for Petrol and Diesel vehicles	33	0	33	10	11	11	11	11	11	8	64	22	11	0	0	11	1	0	0	33	33	3	17	10	27	4	<b>40.8</b>	<b>4</b>
Fuel duty differential based on Life-cycle emissions	50	33	83	25	11	11	11	11	11	8	64	22	11	0	0	11	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	50	50	8	<b>56.0</b>	<b>2</b>

Figure A.15: Detailed results from MCA run C5 (2025-2050 time period)



